

**STATE AID TO HISTORIC PROPERTIES STAFF REPORT
WITH STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS TO
THE NORTH CAROLINA HISTORICAL COMMISSION**
for the
FLORENCE AND MICHAEL HURRICANE DISASTER RELIEF SUBGRANTS
from the
**EMERGENCY SUPPLEMENTAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION FUND (ESHPPF):
Florence, Yutu, and Michael (FYM) Recovery Grant Program**
administered by the National Park Service, Department of the Interior

BACKGROUND

In January 2020, the North Carolina State Historic Preservation Office (HPO) was awarded \$17.07 million congressionally appropriated grant funding by the National Park Service (NPS) to provide recovery assistance to historic properties (including archaeological sites) damaged by hurricanes Florence and/or Michael that are listed in or eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places. **Up to \$9.25 million** was made available for constituent subgrants for bricks and mortar projects or planning projects to aid historic properties in 61 counties in North Carolina declared eligible for federal disaster funding by FEMA.

The [program announcement](#) provides additional information. All projects aided by these monies must be completed by September 30, 2023.

Grant eligibility is limited to the following:

- **National Register status.** To receive consideration for bricks and mortar assistance, properties must be listed in or eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places, and owned by either a nonprofit or local government. For eligible properties, preliminary official determinations of eligibility (PDOE) were sought from the Keeper of the National Register at the National Park Service.
- **Documented damage by Hurricane Florence and/or Michael.** The project has to involve historic or prehistoric resources damaged by Hurricane Florence and/or Michael, which continue to be threatened as a result of storm-related damage.

ROLE OF THE NORTH CAROLINA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

Following submission, constituent subgrant proposals are subject to several vetting steps, the second of which involves the North Carolina Historical Commission (“Commission”).

- **Staff review.** First, a staff committee composed of professional staff of the State Historic Preservation Office and Office of State Archaeology (OSA) ranked all eligible subgrant project proposals.

- **Peer review by North Carolina Historical Commission.** Next, the constituent subgrant project proposals as ranked by the HPO staff committee receive peer review from the Commission. In this regard, the Commission is serving in an advisory role to the State Historic Preservation Officer for award of this federal aid per the [grant subgrant solicitation](#), paralleling the Commission’s review responsibilities for state aid administered by the Department. In other words, the Commission’s review is serving as a peer review for purposes of this federal grant program.
- **Recommendations to State Historic Preservation Officer.** The Commission will make award recommendations to the State Historic Preservation Officer (SHPO). The final award decision will be made by the SHPO in his Federal role as outlined in the National Historic Preservation Act.

Both the Commission and the SHPO reserve the right to add, subtract, and balance project awards from the ranked staff list based upon project schedules, geographic distribution, and significance/rarity/types of resources represented in the list.

- **Submission to and final approval by NPS.** Finally, applications selected by the SHPO for funding approval will be submitted to NPS for final review and approval. Following final review and approval by NPS, all applicants will be notified in writing of the award decisions.

APPLICATION AND REVIEW PROCESS TO DATE

The constituent subgrant program was released to the public on May 27, 2020, with an extensive public outreach program, targeting publicly- or non-profit-owned historic properties throughout the 61 eligible counties. By the August 14, 2020 submission deadline, the HPO received 26 separate applications. These applications were in turn reviewed by HPO and Office of State Archaeology (OSA) staff for project eligibility under NPS requirements for the grant program and conformance with application requirements. Of the 26, only two applications failed to meet requirements and were disqualified. Staff also contacted applicants for clarification where there were questions about scopes of work or budgets. After clarifying adjustments, grant requests exceeded the available funds of \$9.25 million by \$835,833.

SCORING AND DEVELOPMENT OF STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

HPO / OSA staff evaluated the applications against three primary criteria – historical significance (25%), hurricane damage (25%), and project viability (50%) – as outlined in the [Formal Solicitation for Applications](#) and approved by NPS. Scoring was conducted by a team of five to eight HPO and OSA staff specialists, depending on the nature and location of the proposal, using a [numerically-weighted scorecard](#).

The master list of grant proposals ([ShareFile-linked “ESHPPF Grants-Staff Ranked.xlsx” spreadsheet file](#)) provides the following information:

- Name of the project ranked in descending order of score (project name link leads to a ShareFile folder with the application materials).

- Staff scoring average (maximum score without bonus points is 100; potential for up to 15 bonus points).
- Applicant-revised grant request amounts after staff clarification contacts (yellow indicates changes).
- Staff recommended award amounts (green indicates changes or adjustments) to fit awarded projects to available funds.
- Comments describing rationale for staff recommendations and adjustments.
- Running totals for requested and recommended grant amounts.

STAFF FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Staff recommendation # 1: *Staff has reviewed the proposals for each of the places as outlined in its grant application and believes that such plans for 22 of 26 proposed grant awards as set forth herein are practical and feasible and met the requirements of the grant program and should be funded.*

These funds would fund **damage surveys** (historic architectural or archaeological surveys), the **repair of damages from the Hurricanes Florence and/or Michael storm events**, and **improvements for resiliency against future storms**. Additionally, these projects would be undertaken following the relevant federal Secretary of the Interior’s Standards as applicable.

More specifically:

- (1) **Is the property historically authentic?:** Yes, all properties for which subgrant funding is recommended are either listed in the National Register of Historic Places or deemed eligible for National Register listing by the National Park Service through a preliminary official determination of eligibility.
- (2) **Is it of such educational, historical, or cultural significance as to be essential to the development of a balanced State program of historic and archaeological sites and properties?** Yes, the properties are listed in or eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places for a wide variety of historic significance, for example, historic architecture and ethnic history, and under National Register criteria for representing broad patterns of history, association with individuals, archaeological potential, or historic architecture, or the architectural or archaeological survey project in question is likely to yield new listings to tell more of the state’s story.

The specific places for which funding is recommended are:

1. **Bellamy Mansion Museum, New Hanover County** – ca. 1859 Greek Revival mansion, contributing to the Wilmington National Register Historic District; house museum owned and operated by Preservation North Carolina.
2. **Flora Macdonald College Campus, Robeson County** – historic women’s college campus built in twentieth century as successor to 1841 Floral College, one of the first women’s colleges in the South; the campus is a monument to the 19th century devotion to

women's education in the Upper Cape Fear River Valley. It continues its educational mission as a school.

3. **Geer Cemetery, Durham County** – historic African-American cemetery associated as one of last extant landmarks of the Hayti community.
4. **Cumberland County Historic Architectural Survey** – this project will survey this historic county, and likely to capture new rural and post-1945 historic properties.
5. **Carolina Industrial School/Shelter Neck (UCONCI), Pender County** – historic Unitarian-sponsored school, operated from 1902 to 1926 near Burgaw; now a camp.
6. **Moorefields, Orange County** – circa 1785 home of the politically prominent Moore family, and architecturally important as one of the earliest appearances of the Federal style in the state.
7. **Bald Head Island Lighthouse, Brunswick County** – circa 1817 lighthouse near mouth of Cape Fear River; believed to be the oldest standing lighthouse in North Carolina.
8. **East Arcadia Gym, Bladen County** – contributing element to the historic East Arcadia School (a Rosenwald School), and a military surplus gymnasium relocated from Camp Butner following World War II to serve the African American community around East Arcadia.
9. **Historic Turnage Theatre, Beaufort County** – contributes to the Washington National Register Historic District; built as vaudeville theatre in 1913, and expanded in mid-1930s into a “movie palace”; now operated by the Arts of the Pamlico by the local arts council as a performing space.
10. **Mount Pleasant Architectural Survey & Stormwater Mitigation Plan, Cabarrus County** – in a community with two National Register Historic Districts (the Mount Pleasant Historic District and the Mount Pleasant Collegiate Institute Historic District) this planning project would potentially expand the existing town historic district (circa 1840 to 1935) and provide planning to protect historic resources there.
11. **Boney Mill, Duplin County** – this circa 1840 historic mill, along with its dam and millpond, is significant for the association with the industrial development of Wallace through World War II.
12. **Indian Education Resource Center, Robeson County** – this individually listed Works Progress Administration-era former Pembroke High School, circa 1939, now hosts various programs for American Indian students as part of a Title VI Indian Education Program in collaboration with Robeson County Public Schools.
13. **Emmerton School, Onslow County** – this 1920s brick school in Swansboro once served as Town Hall but is now the headquarters of the Swansboro Historical Association, and is a contributing element to the Swansboro National Register Historic District.
14. **John Blue House, Scotland County** – located near Laurinburg, this individually listed 1890s residence with its richly ornamented exterior and interior woodwork is one of the finest examples of late nineteenth century architecture in Scotland County, and was the home of a pioneering inventor whose research and development of patented agricultural machinery aided the revitalization of the cotton economy in the South.
15. **Mill Prong, Hoke County** – This individually listed property has a strong and important association with the settlement and development of the upper Cape Fear region by the Highland Scots who established in the area the largest settlement of their group in the United States, and is one of the few extant rural residences built for a Highland Scot

immigrant and later the residence of Archibald McEachern. Its architecture is Federal with Flemish bond and period finishes. It is a now a house museum.

16. **Hyde County's Historic 1854 Courthouse, Hyde County** – one of the few remaining antebellum courthouses in the state; located in Swan Quarter.
17. **Harmony Hall, Bladen County** – a late 18th century rural home, associated with Revolutionary War Col. James Richardson and individually listed; now owned by the Bladen County Historical Society.
18. **Pantego School #2 Rosenwald, Beaufort County** - Constructed in 1926, Pantego School No.2 is an eight-teacher Rosenwald school of masonry construction. Currently owned by the Beaufort High School Alumni Association, the school is used as a community center hosting meetings, classes, and reunions.
19. **Hastings House, Johnston County** – located in Smithfield, this circa 1840 house is an excellent, and early example, of the transition from Federal style to Greek Revival, and exhibits in both the interior and exterior numerous character-defining features of the mid-1830s period. Preserved by the Downtown Smithfield Development Corporation, and part of the local Parks and Recreation System.
20. **Princeton Graded School, Johnston County** – Constructed in 1925-1926 in the Princeton community, the school was one of ten built in Johnston County between 1919 and 1929 with financial help from the Rosenwald Foundation, and only one of two extant. From 1925 through 1955, the school served as an educational and social center for the African American community. The nonprofit TESS (Taking Education Skills Seriously) of Carolina, dedicated to enhancing educational opportunities for at-risk students, is undertaking its restoration.
21. **Addor Community Center, Moore County** – Also known historically as the Lincoln Park School, this circa 1922 Rosenwald school served for 27 years as an African-American elementary school for the rural community of Addor in southeastern Moore County, and continues its role as a community center now.
22. **Historic Lee County Courthouse, Lee County** -- Erected in 1908, the courthouse is an example of the Neo-Classical Revival style.

(3) The estimated total cost of the project under consideration and the apportionment of said cost among State and nonstate sources:

For properties #1 through #19, 100% of the work contemplated in their submission; for properties #20 through #22:

- Princeton Graded School Repairs, Johnston County (ESHPPF: \$977,475; match: \$56,869, or 5.4%)
- Addor Community Center Repairs, Moore County (ESHPPF: \$758,690; match: \$5,000, or 0.6%)
- Historic Lee County Courthouse Repairs, Lee County (ESHPPF: \$873,749; match: \$53,036, or 5.7%)

(4) Whether practical plans have been or can be developed for the funding of the nonstate portion of the costs: In most cases, staff determined from the application materials that this source of funding is the only means of funding the project. Grant funding for bricks and

mortar historic preservation projects is extraordinarily limited nationwide for properties owned by non-profits or local governments. For these applicants, FEMA funding or insurance proceeds were likewise not available or too limited to undertake the historic preservation work, to our understanding.

- (5) **Whether practical plans have been developed for the continued staffing, maintenance and operation of the property without State assistance:** Staff review indicates that these properties are self-funded through non-State receipts and other assistance. We refer to the application materials and budgetary information for each property to document this answer.

To this end, staff recommends a grant award for **22 of the 26 proposals**, and does *not* recommend funding **4 of the 26 proposals** for the reasons set forth in Staff recommendation #4.

Subgrant agreements between the applicant and the State Historic Preservation Officer will govern the scope and timeline of the projects.

Staff recommendation # 2: *Staff recommends awarding subgrant funds for the following 19 projects;* the total recommended award amount for each of the following projects is composed 100% of monies from the ESHPF.

1. \$219,735 Bellamy Mansion Museum (Roof, Chimney, Foundation, Shutter Repairs), New Hanover County
2. \$520,101 Flora Macdonald Campus (Roof, Window, Masonry Repair), Robeson County
3. \$47,912 Geer Cemetery (Archeological Survey), Durham County
4. \$90,000 Cumberland County Architectural Survey, Cumberland County
5. \$748,150 Carolina Industrial School/Shelter Neck (UCONCI) (Building Elevations), Pender County
6. \$91,928 Moorefields Cemetery (Archaeological Survey), Orange County
7. \$750,000 Bald Head Island Lighthouse (Interior Masonry and Exterior Stucco Repairs, Historic Railing Replacement, Glacis Wall Study), Brunswick County
8. \$360,468 East Arcadia Gym (Timber Structure Repair, Roof/Siding Replacement, Foundation Repair, Interior Restoration), Bladen County
9. \$750,000 Historic Turnage Theatre (Structural, Masonry and Window Repairs), Beaufort County
10. \$94,250 Mount Pleasant (Architectural Survey & Stormwater Mitigation Plan), Cabarrus County
11. \$439,380 Boney Mill (Structural Repair and Restoration), Duplin County
12. \$688,098 Indian Education Resource Center (Masonry Repair, Lintel, Door and Window Replacement, Dormer Restoration), Robeson County
13. \$424,000 Emmerton School (Masonry, Window and Door, and Interior Finishes Repair), Onslow County
14. \$128,000 John Blue House (Foundation, Porch, and Interior Finishes Repairs), Scotland County

15. \$214,390 Mill Prong (Roof Replacement, Chimney Reconstruction, Window, Shutter, and Porch Repair, and Interior and Exterior Painting), Hoke County
16. \$30,000 Hyde County's Historic 1854 Courthouse (Gutter and Drainage Repairs and Historic Structure Analysis), Hyde County
17. \$115,000 Harmony Hall (Roof, Interior Finishes, HVAC and Electrical Replacement, Chimney and Foundation Masonry Repairs), Bladen County
18. \$750,000 Pantego Rosenwald School #2 Roof, (HVAC, Electrical, and Plumbing Replacement, Masonry Repair, Door Repairs/Replacement), Beaufort County
19. \$178,674 Hastings House (Roofing, Masonry, Carpentry and Electrical Repairs, Interior Finishes, and Storm Window Installation), Johnston County

Staff recommendation # 3: *Staff recommends awarding subgrant funds for the following three (3) projects; the total recommended award amount for each of the following projects provide a partial match to the monies from the ESHPF with committed local governmental or donated funds in hand (in the amounts indicated).*

20. \$1,034,344 Princeton Graded School (Roof and Window Repairs, Interior Finishes, HVAC, Plumbing and Electrical Replacement, Storm Windows, Cafeteria Roof Structure Replacement, and ADA improvements), Johnston County (ESHPF: \$977,475; match: \$56,869)
21. \$763,690 Addor Community Center (Structural and Foundation Repairs, Roof and Window Replacement, New Shutters, Mold Remediation, Interior Finishes, HVAC, Electrical, and Plumbing Replacement), Moore County (ESHPF: \$758,690; match: \$5,000)
22. \$926,785 Historic Lee County Courthouse (Roof Replacement, Masonry and Window Repairs, Door Replacement), Lee County (ESHPF: \$873,749; match: \$53,036)

Staff recommendation # 4: *Staff does **not** recommend funding the following projects (for the reasons noted).*

23. **Downtown Wallace National Register Historic District Resurvey, Duplin County** (disqualified because the amount of request was below grant program minimum; infeasible to expand scope of work to meet requirements)
24. **Bay View Cemetery Archaeological Survey, Carteret County** (disqualified because it was determined ineligible for listing in the National Register by the Keeper of the National Register through the Determination of Eligibility process)
25. **Multi-county Survey and Measured Drawings, all 61 eligible counties** (indeterminate project locations and scopes of work)
26. **Latimer House Roof Damage Restoration, New Hanover County** (weakness of application; no capacity to administer grant)

North Carolina State Historic Preservation Office
North Carolina Office of State Archaeology